## Math3033 (Fall 2013-2014)

**Tutorial Note 9** 

Lebesgue Measurable Functions

Key Definitions and Results

**Definition 1.** Let A be a measurable set, we say that  $f : A \to \mathbb{R}$  is a (Lebesgue) measurable function if  $f^{-1}(a,b)$  is a measurable set for every  $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$ .

**Remark.** Implicit to saying  $f : A \to \mathbb{R}$  is measurable is the measurability of A because  $A = f^{-1}(-\infty,\infty)$ , see Theorem 3 for detail.

**Definition 2.** Let  $E \subseteq \mathbb{R}$  be measurable and let P(x) be a property related to points  $x \in \mathbb{R}$ . We say that P(x) holds **almost everywhere (abbr. a.e.) on**  $E^{(*)}$  if

 $m\{x \in E : P(x) \text{ does not hold}\} = 0.$ 

**Theorem 3.** The following are equivalent:

(i)  $f: A \to \mathbb{R}$  is measurable.

(ii)  $f^{-1}[a,b)$  is a measurable set for every  $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$ , a < b.

(iii)  $f^{-1}[a,b]$  is a measurable set for every  $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$ , a < b.

- (iv)  $f^{-1}(a,b)$  is a measurable set for every  $a, b \in \mathbb{R}$ , a < b.
- (v)  $f^{-1}(-\infty, b]$  is a measurable set for every  $b \in \mathbb{R}$ .
- (vi)  $f^{-1}(-\infty, b)$  is a measurable set for every  $b \in \mathbb{R}$ .
- (vii)  $f^{-1}[a,\infty)$  is a measurable set for every  $a \in \mathbb{R}$ .
- (viii)  $f^{-1}(a,\infty)$  is a measurable set for every  $a \in \mathbb{R}$ .
- **Theorem 4 (Topological Continuity).** Let  $A, B \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ , the following are equivalent:
  - (i)  $f: A \to B$  is continuous.
  - (ii) For every open set U,  $f^{-1}(U) = V \cap A$ , for some V open.
  - (iii) For every bounded open interval (a,b),  $f^{-1}(a,b) = U \cap A$ , for some U open.

## Theorem 5 (Summary on Properties of Measurable Functions).

- (i) Let A, B be measurable. If  $g : B \to \mathbb{R}$  is continuous and  $f : A \to B$  is measurable, then  $g \circ f : A \to \mathbb{R}$  is also measurable.
- (ii) If  $f_1, f_2 : A \to \mathbb{R}$  are measurable, then  $f_1 + f_2, f_1 f_2, f_1 f_2, \frac{f_1}{f_2}$   $(f(x) \neq 0, \forall x), \max\{f_1(x), f_2(x)\}$  and  $\min\{f_1(x), f_2(x)\}$  are measurable functions.
- (iii) Let  $f_1, f_2, f_3, \dots : E \to \mathbb{R}$  be measurable functions, then

provided they exist in  $\mathbb{R}$  at a.e.  $x \in E$  $\sup_{n \ge 1} f_n(x), \quad \inf_{n \to \infty} f_n(x), \quad \underbrace{\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x)}_{n \to \infty} f_n(x), \quad \underbrace{\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x)}_{n \to \infty} f_n(x),$   $\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) \text{ (if } f_n \to f \text{ ptwise a.e. on } E)$ 

are measurable.

- (iv) Let  $f,g: A \to \mathbb{R}$  be two functions such that f = g a.e.. If f is measurable, so is g.
- (v) Continuous Functions defined on a measurable domain are measurable.

**Example 1.** Let 
$$A \subseteq \mathbb{R}$$
, show that  
 $\chi_A(x) := \begin{cases} 1 & \text{when } x \in A \\ 0 & \text{when } x \notin A \end{cases}$  is measurable  $\iff A$  is measurable.

**Solution.** For every  $a \in \mathbb{R}$  we have

$$\chi_A^{-1}[a,\infty) = \begin{cases} \emptyset, & a > 1, \\ A, & a \in (0,1], \\ \mathbb{R}, & a \leq 0. \end{cases}$$

Therefore  $\chi_A$  is measurable if and only if  $\emptyset$ , *A* and  $\mathbb{R}$  are all measurable if and only if *A* is measurable.

<sup>(\*)</sup> Or that P(x) holds for almost every (abbr. a.e.)  $x \in E$ .

**Example 2.** Let  $f_1, f_2, \dots : E \to \mathbb{R}$  be a sequence of measurable functions which is pointwise bounded, i.e.,  $\{f_n(x)\}_{n=1}^{\infty}$  is bounded for every  $x \in E$ .

Without using  $M_k/m_k$  Theorem, show that

$$\overline{\lim_{n \to \infty}} f_n$$
 and  $\underline{\lim_{n \to \infty}} f_n$ 

are measurable functions on E.

**Solution.** We check that  $\overline{\lim} f_n$  is measurable by showing that for every  $a \in \mathbb{R}$ , the set

$$A := \{ x \in E : \overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a \}$$

is measurable. Let  $a \in \mathbb{R}$ , then for  $x \in A$ , we try to find another description of x in order to express A in another form. Equivalently, since  $x \in A$  iff  $\overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a$ , we try to modify the statement that  $\overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a$ .

**Unsuccessful but Necessary Trial.** Specifically,  $\overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a$  implies

$$\exists N \ge 1, \forall n \ge N, f_n(x) < a.$$

Note that the last statement cannot be reversed. Since if we take  $\overline{\lim}$  on both sides, "<" becomes " $\leq$ ". But still we can proceed by modifying the bound *a*.

Correct Way. We have

$$\begin{split} \overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a \implies \exists p \in \mathbb{N}, \overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a - \frac{1}{p} \\ \implies \exists p \in \mathbb{N}, \exists N \in \mathbb{N}, \forall n \ge N, f_n(x) < a - \frac{1}{p} \end{split}$$

Fortunately the last statement can be reversed to  $\overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a$ , so we have

$$A = \{x \in E : \overline{\lim} f_n(x) < a\}$$
$$= \left\{ x \in E : \exists p \in \mathbb{N}, \exists N \in \mathbb{N}, \forall n \ge N, f_n(x) < a - \frac{1}{p} \right\}$$
$$= \bigcup_{p=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{N=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{n=N}^{\infty} \left\{ x \in E : f_n(x) < a - \frac{1}{p} \right\}$$
$$= \bigcup_{p=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{N=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{n=N}^{\infty} f_n^{-1} \left( -\infty, a - \frac{1}{p} \right).$$

As every union and intersection is countable, by the hypothesis that  $f_n$ 's are measurable, we are done.

Now  $\underline{\lim} f_n = -\overline{\lim}(-f_n)$  is measurable by the last paragraph.

**Exercise 1.** Let  $f : E \to \mathbb{R}$  be measurable. Show that if *A* has measure zero, then *f* is measurable if and only if  $f|_{E \setminus A} : E \setminus A \to \mathbb{R}$  is measurable.

**Exercise 2 (2012 Final).** Let *W* be a measurable subset of  $\mathbb{R}$  with m(W) > 0. For  $n = 1, 2, 3, ..., \text{let } f_n : W \to \mathbb{R}$  be a measurable function such that

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} f_n(x) \in \mathbb{R} \quad \text{for a.e. } x \in W.$$

Prove that there exists a c > 0 and a measurable set  $V \subseteq W$  with m(V) > 0 such that  $x \in V \implies |f_n(x)| \le c$  for all n = 1, 2, 3, ...

**Example 3 (2007 Final).** Let *S* be an uncountable set. For every  $s \in S$ , let  $f_s : \mathbb{R} \to [0,1]$  be a continuous function. Define  $f(x) = \sup\{f_s(x) : s \in S\}$ . Prove that *f* is measurable.

## **Solution.** Let $a \in \mathbb{R}$ , then

$$f(x) < a \iff \sup_{s \in S} f_s(x) < a \implies \forall s \in S, f_s(x) < a$$

The last statement cannot be reversed to the first since < becomes  $\leq$  when taking supremum. Then what to do? Either we shrink the bound *a* as in Example 2 (left as exercise) or we try  $\leq a$ , > a or  $\geq a$  instead.

Note that when S is countable the statement is trivial since we have already such a result that

$$f_1, f_2, \dots$$
 measurable  $\implies \sup_{n \ge 1} f_n$  measurable.

We expect the proof is a bit different. Thus continuity must be brought into consideration.

**Method 1.** Let's consider  $\leq a$ . We have for any  $a \in \mathbb{R}$ ,

$$f(x) \le a \iff f_s(x) \le a, \forall s \in S$$

therefore

$$f^{-1}(-\infty,a] = \bigcap_{s \in S} f_s^{-1} \underbrace{(-\infty,a]}_{\text{closed}}$$

thus  $f^{-1}(-\infty, a]$  is an intersection of closed set, it must be closed and hence measurable.

**Method 2.** Let's consider > *a*, from Supremum Limit Theorem we have

$$f(x) > a \iff \exists s \in S, f_s(x) > a,$$

therefore we have

$$\{x\in\mathbb{R}:f(x)>a\}=\bigcup_{s\in S}\{x\in\mathbb{R}:f_s(x)>a\}=\bigcup_{s\in S}f_s^{-1}(a,\infty).$$

Since  $\bigcup_{s \in S} f_s^{-1}(a, \infty)$  is a union of open sets, which is open and hence measurable.

**Remark.** We wouldn't expect to argue like " $\bigcup_{s \in S}$  (measurable) is measurable" since the union  $\bigcup_{s \in S}$  is uncountable.

**Exercise 3 (2004 Final).** Let *W* be a nonempty subset of  $\mathbb{R}$ , define  $f : \mathbb{R} \to [0,\infty)$  by letting f(x) be the greatest lower bound of  $\{|x - w| : w \in W\}$ . Prove that *f* is measurable.

**Example 4 (2005 Final).** Let  $f : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  be a function. Suppose for every  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists a continuous  $g : \mathbb{R} \to \mathbb{R}$  such that  $S = \{x \in \mathbb{R} : f(x) \neq g(x)\}$  is measurable with  $m(S) < \epsilon$ . Prove that f is a measurable function.

**Remark.** The converse of this statement is a famous result in measure theory known as <u>Lusin's Theorem</u>.

**Solution.** Now for every  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  we may set  $\epsilon = \frac{1}{n}$ , then by hypothesis there is  $g_n \in C(\mathbb{R})$  and a measurable  $A_n$  such that  $f|_{A_n} = g|_{A_n}$  and  $m(\mathbb{R} \setminus A_n) < \frac{1}{n}$ . We expect  $A := \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n$  is so "huge" that  $m(\mathbb{R} \setminus A) = 0$ . Indeed,

$$\forall n \in \mathbb{N}, \quad m(\mathbb{R} \setminus A) \le m(\mathbb{R} \setminus A_n) < \frac{1}{n},$$

by taking  $n \to \infty$ ,  $m(\mathbb{R} \setminus A) = 0$ . Let's show that  $f|_A$  is measurable as  $\mathbb{R} \setminus A$  is negligible, more precisely, by Exercise 1, f is measurable if and only if  $f|_A$  is measurable.

Method 1. We have

$$\{x \in A : f|_A(x) > a\} = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \{x \in A_n : g_n|_{A_n}(x) > a\} = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} \underbrace{(g_n^{-1}(a,\infty))}_{\text{open}} \cap A_n$$

so  $\{x \in A : f|_A(x) > a\}$  is a countable union of measurable sets, which must be measurable.

**Method 2.** Define  $A'_1 = A_1$  and  $A'_n = A_n \setminus \bigcup_{i=1}^{n-1} A_i$  for  $n \ge 2$ , then  $\{A'_n\}$  is disjoint and  $\bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A'_n = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n = A$ , hence

$$f|_A = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} f|_{A'_n} \chi_{A'_n} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} g_n \chi_{A'_n},$$

so  $f|_A$  is a pointwise limit of measurable functions, and thus measurable.

**Example 5 (2009 Final).** Let  $f : [0,\infty) \to [0,1]$  be measurable. Prove that the set

$$S = \left\{ a \in [0,\infty) : \sum_{i=1}^{\infty} f(a+i) \in \mathbb{R} \right\}$$

is measurable.

**Solution.** We note that the Cauchy criterion for the convergence of  $\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} f(a+i)$  can be written as

$$\forall k \in \mathbb{N}, \exists N \in \mathbb{N}, \forall n \ge N, \forall m \ge n, \sum_{i=n}^{m} f(a+i) < \frac{1}{k}.$$

Therefore

$$\left\{a\in[0,\infty):\sum_{i=1}^{\infty}f(a+i)\in\mathbb{R}\right\}=\bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty}\bigcup_{N=1}^{\infty}\bigcap_{n=N}^{\infty}\bigcap_{m=n}^{\infty}\left\{a\in[0,\infty):\sum_{i=n}^{m}f(a+i)<\frac{1}{k}\right\}$$

Clearly it remains to check the measurability of  $f_i(x) := f(x+i)$ . For every interval (a,b) we have

$$\begin{aligned} x \in f_i^{-1}(a,b) & \Longleftrightarrow f_i(x) = f(x+i) \in (a,b) \\ & \longleftrightarrow x + i \in f^{-1}(a,b) \\ & \Longleftrightarrow x \in -i + f^{-1}(a,b), \end{aligned}$$

hence

$$f_i^{-1}(a,b) = -i + f^{-1}(a,b).$$

Since a translation of a measurable set is still measurable,  $f_i$  is measurable. Now

$$S = \bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{N=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{n=N}^{\infty} \bigcap_{m=n}^{\infty} \underbrace{(f_n + f_{n+1} + \dots + f_m)^{-1} [0, \frac{1}{k})}_{\text{measurable}}$$

is measurable.

In the following let's slightly generalize the above example. Of course we can copy, word by word, the solution of the above example, let's solve it alternatively:

**Exercise 4.** Let  $f_1, f_2, f_3, \dots : E \to \mathbb{R}$  be a sequence of measurable functions. Show that

 $A := \{x \in E : \{f_n(x)\}_{n=1}^{\infty} \text{ converges}\}\$ 

is measurable by taking  $\overline{\lim}_{n\to\infty} f_n$  and  $\underline{\lim}_{n\to\infty} f_n$  into account.

**Caution:** It is not as simple as it seems to be since  $\overline{\lim} f_n(x)$  and  $\underline{\lim} f_n(x)$  are possibly unbounded,  $\overline{\lim} f_n - \underline{\lim} f_n$  may carry no meaning in this case, moreover, function taking value in  $\{-\infty,\infty\}$  is not considered as a measurable function **in this course**.

**Example 6.** Every real number  $x \in (0,1]$  has a unique **nonterminating representation**<sup>(†)</sup> (we signify it by putting a  $_{\times}$  at the tail)

 $x = 0.a_1a_2a_3\ldots_{\times}.$ 

We define a function  $f:(0,1] \to \mathbb{R}$  pointwise by

$$f(x) = \sup\{a_k : x = 0.a_1a_2a_3... \in (0,1], k \in \mathbb{N}\},\$$

show that f is measurable.

**Solution.** Method 1. By Exercise 5, f(x) = 9 a.e., and constant function 9 is measurable, so *f* is measurable.

Method 2. Let

$$A_k = \{x \in (0,1] : x = 0.a_1a_2...\times, a_i \ge k, \exists i\}.$$

Then observe that when  $f(x) = \ell$ , we have

$$x \in A_1, x \in A_2, \dots, x \in A_\ell, x \notin A_{\ell+1}, \dots, x \notin A_9.$$

Then we find that  $\sum_{i=1}^{9} \chi_{A_i}(x) = \ell$ , therefore we have

$$f = \sum_{i=1}^{9} \chi_{A_i}$$

It remains to check that each  $A_i$  is measurable, we leave it as a practice in Exercise 6.

**Exercise 5.** Prove the above example by showing that

$$m\{x = 0.a_1a_2... \in (0,1] : a_i = 9 \text{ for some } i\} = 1.$$

**Exercise 6.** Show that

$$A_k := \left\{ x \in (0,1]: \begin{array}{c} x = 0.a_1 a_2 \dots \times, \\ \exists i, a_i \ge k \end{array} \right\} = \bigcup_{i=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{a_i = k}^{9} \bigcup_{j=0}^{10^{i-1}-1} \left( \frac{10j + a_i}{10^i}, \frac{10j + a_i + 1}{10^i} \right]$$

Hint: Imitate the solution of Practice Exercise 80 of lecture notes.